Avoiding, Enforcing, Defending: What Should You Know About Dealing With Conservation Easement Violations?

Carol Lynn Trocki - Freelance Conservation Biologist
Chuck Allott – Executive Director, Aquidneck Land Trust
Greg Schultz - RI Attorney General’s Office - Environmental Unit
• National research supports the fact that conservation easement violations and other challenges increase when properties protected with conservation easements are sold to new owners.

• Turnover among land trust board and/or staff members makes it even more important to make sure you have appropriate documentation, policies, and procedures in place.

• Stuff happens. Perpetuity is a REALLY long time.
Avoid Legal Issues with Pre-violation Documentation

Look to the End Game

• What will I need to prove in an enforcement action?
• What wouldn’t I want in my file in an enforcement action?

Drafting and Recording Tips

• Be careful in relying on an outside source for opinion on violations and impact on conservation values. The source may not be there or may not be willing to give an opinion.
• Give yourself flexibility so that amendment is unnecessary.
Avoid Legal Issues with Pre-violation Documentation

Drafting and Recording Tips (continued)…

• Be careful of using undefined terms that will later be interpreted in establishing a violation.

  Ex. No cutting or planting of trees (except for maintenance). What does maintenance mean?

• Be clairvoyant! Try to anticipate evolution of uses.

  For instance, in agricultural easements you need to have flexibility to ensure economic viability.

  Subdivision, wind turbines or other energy development, reasonable out zones…

• Forebearance Clauses – Allow for flexibility in enforcement without eroding future rights to enforce.
Avoid Legal Issues with Pre-violation Documentation

Baseline Documentation Reports & Management Plans

• Have them! Use them! Know where to find them.

• Complete a BDR for the protected property prior to closing and reference this as an exhibit in your easement.

• Require all parties sign off on the BDR, acknowledging the condition of the property and its conservation values at the time the easement is conveyed.

• If BDRs and MPs are referenced as exhibits to the easement, record them as an exhibit with the easement.

BDRs are the baseline reference against which your easement will be monitored and enforced in the future!
Avoid Legal Issues with Pre-violation Documentation

Land Trust Policy

• Create a Violation Policy and an Enforcement Policy
• Be in compliance with them!
Avoiding Violations

Maintain Good Landowner Relations

• Don’t let annual monitoring visits be your only contact with landowners
• Develop successful strategies for conveyance and generational transitions

Develop Third Party Relationships

• Reach out to abutters, realtors, and other stakeholders

Build Credibility in the Community

• Community outreach
Avoiding Violations

Regular & Comprehensive Monitoring

• Be a land trust that means business!

Communication & Understanding are Key

• Lots of bad situations can be avoided when everyone is sharing information and paying attention…

Amending Conservation Easements

(a workshop in itself…)
Enforcing and Defending Violations

Enforcement and a Land Trust’s Tax Exempt Status

Terra Firma & Claims

Pros & Cons of Mediation and Arbitration

Post-violation Documentation
  • Site Documentation (BDR, Monitoring Reports, violation documentation)
  • Other Documentation
Enforcing and Defending Violations

Notice of Violation & Compliance with all NOV requirements of Conservation Easement

Litigation and Community Perception

• Competing pressure from constituents
Defending Violations

State Legislation

RIGL 34-39-3 ‘Restrictions Enforceable’

• empowers the RI Attorney General’s Office to enforce Conservation Easements, regardless of whether the State is a party

• allows for the prevailing party to obtain attorneys’ fees and cost (at court’s discretion)

• creates a strong incentive to avoid CE violations and a strong tool to defend
Defending Violations

State Legislation & the Attorney General

RIGL 34-39-5 ‘Release of Restriction’

• provides clear framework for CE amendment
• requires AG’s participation
• clarity and strict process protects CEs from improper attempts to alter / amend

New Legislation Proposed

• House Bill H7684 would add RIGL 34-20-1.1 “Damages for encroachment on state, municipal or non-profit land…”
Defending Violations – Role of RIDEM & RIAG

- both important parties in helping to avoid, defend, and enforce
- resource for information on relevant state & federal law and interpretation of the rights and restrictions in a CE
- both act as a ‘backstop’ to help, especially to small land trusts
Resources

Rhode Island Land and Water Partnership Resource Library
http://www.landandwaterpartnership.org/library.php

Baseline Documentation Report Resources
http://www.rilandtrusts.org/workshops.htm

RI General Legislation Chapter 34-39 “Conservation and Preservation Restrictions on Real Property”
http://webserver.rilin.state.ri.us/Statutes/TITLE34/34-39/INDEX.htm

RIDEM Division of Planning & Development
http://www.dem.ri.gov/programs/bpoladm/plandev/

RIAG Contact – Greg Schultz, Environmental & Land Use Unit
Contacts & Questions

Gregory S. Schultz
Special Assistant Attorney General
(401) 274-4400 x2400 / gschultz@riag.ri.gov

Chuck Allott, Esq.
Executive Director, Aquidneck Land Trust
(401) 849-2799 x12 / callott@ailt.org

Carol Lynn Trocki
Consulting Conservation Biologist
(401) 952-2937 / cltrocki@gmail.com